

Banaras Hindu University

Minutes of the meeting of the Executive Council held at 10:30 a.m. on November 01-02, 2020 at Banaras Hindu University, Varanasi.

Members Present:

1. Prof. Rakesh Bhatnagar, Vice-Chancellor	In the Chair
2. Prof. Adya Prasad Pandey	Member
3. Prof. Anand Mohan	Member
4. Prof. Bachcha Singh	Member
5. Prof. Ashim Kumar Mukherjee	Member
6. Dr. Neeraj Tripathi, Registrar	Secretary

Prof. H.C. Nainwal, Dr. A. K. Tripathi, Prof. Ram Naresh Mishra and Prof. A.K. Singh, Member of the Executive Council, attended the meeting through video conferencing. Prof. V. K. Shukla, Rector, could not attend the meeting. Dr. Abhay Kumar Thakur, Finance Officer, Banaras Hindu University attended the meeting on 01.11.2020 as an Invitee.

At the outset, the Vice-Chancellor and Chairman of the Executive Council extended a warm welcome to the Hon'ble Members of the Executive Council and expressed his gratitude to them for their help and guidance.

The Agenda items were then taken up.

ECR 217
ITEM 1

CONSIDERED confirmation of Minutes of the Executive Council Meeting held on August 30, 2020

The Minutes of the Executive Council meeting held on August 30, 2020, were circulated to the Hon'ble Members of the Executive Council vide email dated 17.10.2020 for their comments / suggestions thereon.

Prof. Anand Mohan, Prof. Bachcha Singh, Prof. A. K. Tripathi and Dr. A.K. Singh, members, Executive Council have sent their comments / suggestions in response to the above. However, no comments have been received from Prof. A. K. Mukherjee, Prof. R. N. Mishra, Prof. A. P. Pandey and Prof. H.C. Nainwal.

The Executive Council considered the comments of the Hon'ble members on the drafts minutes of the Executive Council meeting held on October 30, 2020 and after deliberations, the following was decided:

The points elaborated by Prof. Anand Mohan are annexed (**Annexure-1**). In reference to the point No. 1 mentioned by Prof. Anand Mohan in his comment on ECR 214 Ex-agenda-Item-3, Executive Council except Prof. Anand Mohan resolved that the said observations may form a part of the report as separate Annexure. In reference to point No. 2 and 3 of the minutes, the matter has already been addressed at ECR 230 item 14.

RESOLVED THAT minutes of the meeting dated October 30, 2020 be confirmed with the following:

1. In ECR No.199 Item-1

The word 'displeasure' be used instead of 'advisory' as was decided.

2. ECR No. 204 Item-6

The resolution should be modified to read as under:

'RESOLVED THAT the matter be first placed before the Governing Body of the IMS and then be brought to the Executive Council.'

It shall be mandatory for the Governing Body to consider the observation of the Executive Council with regard to UGC sanction of separate teaching post for Trauma Centre and Mahamana Centenary Superspeciality Complex. While considering the proposal of IMS PPC.

3. ECR No.211 Item-30

The name of Centenary Superspeciality Complex, IMS, BHU be corrected as Mahamana Centenary Superspeciality Complex in the resolution of Executive Council.

4. ECR No. 215 Ex-Agenda-4

The minutes be modified to read as under:

'The matter of appointment of Emeritus Professor and Distinguished Professor came up for discussion and the Executive Council authorized the Vice-Chancellor to reconstitute the Consultative Committee which shall include at least one member of Executive Council in it, and submit its recommendation on conferment of the Emeritus Professorship and Distinguished Professorship.'

**ECR 218
ITEM 2**

CONSIDERED the action taken on the decisions of the Executive Council in its meeting held on June 23, 2020 (adjourned) and scheduled again on July 15, 2020.

The Executive Council perused the Action Taken on decisions of its meeting held on June 23, 2020 (adjourned) and

scheduled again on July 15, 2020 and pointed out that the action on issuance of displeasure notice to the members of the FAC and reconstitution of Legal Cell has yet not been taken. The Vice-Chancellor informed that this will be completed in a week time. The Executive Council then resolved as under:

RESOLVED THAT the action taken on the decisions of the Executive Council in its meeting held on June 23, 2020 (adjourned) and scheduled again on July 15, 2020 placed at Annexure-2 of the Agenda be recorded and approved with the above.

**ECR 219
ITEM 3**

CONSIDERED confirmation of the Minutes of the meeting of the Executive Council held by circulation vide email dated September 23, 2020.

RESOLVED THAT the Executive Council meeting held by circulation vide email dated September 23, 2020, be confirmed.

**ECR 220
ITEM 4**

CONSIDERED the orders of the Vice-Chancellor regarding confirmation of teachers and Group 'A' Officers of the University.

The Executive Council noted that the appointment of teachers as well as Group 'A' Officers is made by the Executive Council on probation for one year and on successful completion of probation they are confirmed on their respective posts under the orders of the Vice-Chancellor who is authorized to do so by the Executive Council (ECR 29 of 1977). Due process of confirmation had been followed before passing order for

confirmation of teachers and Group 'A' Officers of the university listed in Appendix-3 of the agenda.

RESOLVED THAT the orders of the Vice-Chancellor for confirmation of teachers and Group 'A' Officers of the University as per Annexure-4 of the Agenda, be approved.

**ECR 221
ITEM 5**

CONSIDERED the decisions of the Investment Committee for investing funds of Banaras Hindu University on 15.09.2020.

RESOLVED THAT the decisions of the Investment Committee for investing funds of Banaras Hindu University on 15.09.2020 as per Annexure-4 of the Agenda, be approved.

**ECR 222
ITEM 6**

CONSIDERED the recommendations of Selection Committees for appointment of teachers in different departments of the University.

The Vice-Chancellor informed that Prof. A.K. Mukherjee, member, Executive Council, BHU wrote a letter to the Vice-Chancellor suggesting to keep the envelopes of Senior Professor in abeyance for which interviews have been held so far. The same may be considered when the matter of eligibility criterion of medical Faculty for the promotions as Senior Professor, get resolved (**Annexure-6A**).

Prof. A.P. Pandey, member, Executive Council, BHU raised the issue that many candidates who are having the teaching experience at ANM and GNM and not at graduation level have

been shortlisted and interviewed for the post of Assistant Professor in the College of Nursing which need to be reviewed. In the light of the fact that when the post is of Assistant Professor, College of Nursing to teach B.Sc. Nursing, the teaching experience should be at the level of at least undergraduate. He also pointed out that a candidate named Bishwajeet Sardar has been called for interview for the post of Assistant Director (Football) who had been terminated from service of Mahatma Gandhi Kashi Vidyapeeth, Varanasi. Deliberating over the issue in detail the Executive Council resolved as under:

RESOLVED THAT the recommendation of the selection committee for appointment/promotion under CAS of teachers and promotion of Assistant Registrar as Deputy Registrar, appointment/promotion of the Assistant Directors of Sports Board and Officers in the library sector, except the recommendations for appointment of Professor of Animal Genetics and Breeding, Faculty of Veterinary Sciences, Assistant Professor, College of Nursing, Assistant Director (Football) and promotion as Senior Professor under CAS, be approved as per Annexure-6B of the minutes.

RESOLVED FURTHER THAT for the post of Professor of Animal Genetics and Breeding, Faculty of Veterinary Sciences the envelope containing recommendation of selection committee be not opened and an inquiry be first conducted on the following:

1. The complaint of using the University residence allotted in her name for running a private company.
2. To review her eligibility for appointment on the aforesaid post of Professor.

RESOLVED FURTHER THAT for the post of Assistant Professor, College of Nursing the fulfillment of the eligibility of three teaching experience as tutor by the applicants be reviewed. The Vice-Chancellor is authorized to constitute a committee for the same.

RESOLVED STILL FURTHER THAT for the post of Assistant Director (Football) the facts regarding complaint against one of the candidates named Bishwajeet Sardar of termination of his service in Mahatma Gandhi Kashi Vidyapeeth (MGKVP), Varanasi be first ascertained from the Mahatma Gandhi Kashi Vidyapeeth, Varanasi (MGKVP), Varanasi. Facts be confirmed from the employer.

RESOLVED STILL FURTHER THAT the recommendations of the selection committee for promotion of Professors as Senior Professors be not opened.

**ECR 223
ITEM 7**

CONSIDERED the extension of the appointment of persons on Centennial Chairs in Bharat Adhyayan Kendra for a further period of one year i.e. up to completion of five years as per terms of the Chairs.

RESOLVED THAT a report on the work performance and achievements by the Centenary Professors in the centre

alongwith its future plans be put up before the Executive Council.

**ECR 224
ITEM 8**

CONSIDERED the Minutes of the meeting of the Central Hindu School Board held on September 07, 2020.

RESOLVED THAT the Minutes of the meeting of the Central Hindu School Board held on September 07, 2020, be approved

**ECR 225
ITEM 9**

CONSIDERED the Report of the Fact Finding Committee constituted to enquire into the charges levelled against Dr. Hareeshwar Dixit, Professor, Department of Veda, Faculty of Sanskrit Vidya Dharm Vigyan, B.H.U.

RESOLVED THAT the legal opinion on the recommendations on the Fact Finding Committee be first obtained.

**ECR 226
ITEM 10**

CONSIDERED the letter F.No.8-1/ 2014 (CU) Vo. V dated 10th July, 2020 of Ms. Kulvinder Kaur, Deputy Secretary, University Grants Commission accompanying therewith Office Memorandum No. 39020/03/2009-Estt (B) dated 3rd August, 2010 of Mr. Rakesh Moza, Under Secretary to the Government of India, Ministry of Personnel, Public Grievances and Pensions (Department of Personnel and Training), New Delhi regarding need for concerted efforts to increase the representation of Women in employment under Central Government/ Central Autonomous Bodies.

RESOLVED THAT the letter F.No.8-1/ 2014 (CU) Vo. V dated 10th July, 2020 of Ms. Kulvinder Kaur, Deputy Secretary, University Grants Commission, be approved for implementation and the ordinance

11.1(A) be amended to the aforesaid extent.

RESOLVED FURTHER THAT the amendment in the ordinance 11.1(A) sent to the MHRD for placing before the Visitors and a Parliament in terms of the provisions of Clause 18(6) and Clause 19(5) of BHU Act respectively.

**ECR 227
ITEM 11**

CONSIDERED adoption of National Innovation and Startup Policy 2019 of Ministry of Education, Government of India for students and Faculty of the Banaras Hindu University.

RESOLVED THAT National Innovation and Startup Policy 2019 of Ministry of Education, Government of India for students and Faculty of the Banaras Hindu University be adopted with the condition that the sharing of the revenue generated under this shall be 60% to the inventor, 10% to the department and 10% to the faculty concerned and 20% for the University.

RESOLVED FURTHER THAT the committee may review the sharing pattern to make it more liberal in the initial stage of implementation (say five years) to nurture and support the initiative.

**ECR 228
ITEM 12**

CONSIDERED the recommendations of the Committee constituted to arrive at a decision on the representations of Dr. V. Shunmuga Sundaram, Professor, Faculty of Commerce to provide advantage of promotion as Professor under CAS and the appointment as Professor under Direct Recruitment

Scheme (Open Post) in the same Department i.e. Faculty of Commerce.

RESOLVED THAT the recommendations of the Committee, be approved.

**ECR 229
ITEM 13**

CONSIDERED the letter no. F.1-2/2020(JCRC), dated 09.06.2020 of Under Secretary, University Grants Commission for implementation of Consolidated guidelines regarding Modified Assured Career Progression Scheme for the non-teaching employees of the Central Universities/UGC maintained Deemed to be Universities, as notified vide Office Memorandum No. 35034/3/2015- Estt.(D), dated 22.10.2019 of Department of Personnel and Training, Ministry of Personnel, Public Grievances and Pension, Government of India. **(Annexure-13A).**

RESOLVED THAT the letter no. F.1-2/2020(JCRC), dated 09.06.2020 of Under Secretary, University Grants Commission for implementation of Consolidated guidelines regarding Modified Assured Career Progression Scheme for the non-teaching employees of the Central Universities/UGC maintained Deemed to be Universities, be approve for implementation

**ECR 230
ITEM 14**

CONSIDERED the recommendation of the Fact-Finding Committee constituted to inquire a fresh the matter related to the complaint regarding the award of scores to Prof. A.K. Rai, Prof. Saurabh Singh and Prof. Ajit Singh for promotion under CAS from Associate Professor (Stage-4) to Professor (Stage-5) by the Screening Committee of the Department of Orthopaedics, IMS.

It was informed by the Vice-chancellor that on receipt of complaints of Shri Brijesh Pandey, Vill. & P.O.- Purushottampur, Narayanpur, Chunar, Mirzapur letter dated

Nil, Shri Harendra Pratap Singh vide letter dated November 09, 2019 and Shri Vijay Prasad Shukla, Vill.-Chillupar, P.O.-Barahalganj, Gorakhpur vide letter dated December 04, 2019 against Prof. A.K. Rai, Prof. Saurabh Singh and Prof. Ajit Singh for alleging submission of fake documents /information to get promotion to the post of Professor under CAS. A committee was constituted to inquire into the facts of the matter. The committee after its inquiry submitted its report. However, one of the accused represented before the Vice-Chancellor that the committee while considering the allegations against him did not give him a chance to appear before it and clarify his position and thus violated the process of natural justice. A legal opinion was taken on the matter and based on the legal opinion it was decided to constitute another committee to find out the facts of the matter afresh by giving all the accused a chance to clarify their position.

In view of this, another committee was constituted under the chairmanship of Prof. A.S. Raghubanshi, Director, IESD, and, Prof. A.K. Pandey, Faculty of Law, a member, Prof. K.K. Gupta, Department of General Medicine a member and The Dy. Registrar, IMS as member secretary. The committee was requested to submit its report within a fortnight. The observations and the documents given by Hon'ble Executive Council member Prof. Anand Mohan, were also forwarded to the committee for consideration.

The aforesaid Committee vide letter No. nil dated October 20, 2020 submitted its report. Before consideration of the item the Vice-Chancellor requested Prof. A.S. Raghuvanshi, Director, IESD, the Chairman of the Committee and Prof. A.K. Pandey, Faculty of Law, a member of the Committee to make a presentation on the findings of the committee. Accordingly

they made a presentation before the Executive Council. The findings of the committee interalia include the following:

...XX...XX...XX

CONCLUSION & RECOMMENDATIONS

With a hope that cascading allegations and counter-allegations shall not take place in after this report, the conclusion and recommendations of the Committee are as under:

A. In respect of Prof. A. K. Rai

The Committee is of the opinion that Prof. A. K. Rai claimed more API on some items in Category I, II and III of the Application Form and the Screening Committee has awarded Score as claimed. The actual API Score of Prof. A. K. Rai in category I is 105, API Score in Category II is 22.5 and in Category III is 59.0 **These minor changes in API Score are not likely to affect the promotion of Prof. A. K. Rai under CAS.**

Further, while recommending and forwarding the Application Form of Prof. Ajit Singh in the capacity of Head of the Department, Prof. A.K. Rai without considering relevant documents forwarded the information given by Prof. Ajit Singh when (during the period 2010 to 2017) he was not in the service of BHU. Such a conduct on the part of the Head, Department of Orthopaedics, IMS is not only unethical, but also in gross violation of law; this irresponsive conduct is highly deplorable. Adding one more procedural anomaly, it is to be pointed that the Screening Committee arbitrarily counted the past service rendered by Prof. Ajit Singh which was not in conformity with the University norms. **While the recommendation and forwarding of application and screening were done blindly, the counting of past services of Prof. Ajit Singh was done deliberately having no power in this regard and with utter disregard to University norms, which shows arbitrariness on the part of Head of the Department and the Screening Committee.**

B. In respect of Prof. Saurabh Singh

The Committee is of the view that Alkem Lab. Ltd. Clinical Trial Agreement was signed before the date of eligibility

for Professor under CAS. Further, the Project was multi-centric and the cost of the Project was of approx. Rs. 5 Crores excluding drug manufacturing cost and 86 patients were randomized for Clinical Trial which amounted approx. 36 lakh and for which Prof. Saurabh Singh is to be awarded 20 API Score and not 15.

Publication in Cleveland Clinic Journal (CCJM) was of Prof. Saurabh Singh, IMS, BHU and not of any other person serving at AIIMS, Jodhpur, Rajasthan and he was entitled to 10 API Score for this publication. Further, while two publications were in the Global Journal of Research Analysis thus 20 API Score should be awarded to him. The allegation of supervising only 4 MS Theses during Associate Professor and not 9 MS Theses is devoid of substance; the record reveals that Prof. Saurabh Singh supervised 10 MS Thesis during the term of Associate Professor.

Workshop on Trauma System & Mass Casualty Management Course held in Israel from April 26 to May 7, 2015 entitles him 10 API Score. For presenting Policy Document on Mass Casualty Situations, Prof. Saurabh Singh is entitled for 20 API Score. The allegation that Prof. Saurabh did not study Biology at +2 level is devoid of any merit and substance. **The Committee though recommends for the award of API Score as suggested above, but these changes will not affect the promotion of Prof. Saurabh Singh under CAS.**

C. In respect of Prof. Ajit Singh

The Committee is of the considered opinion that the services rendered by Prof. Ajit Singh at RMCH, Bareilly and AIIMS, Raipur cannot be counted and the counting of his service by the Screening Committee and determination of the date of eligibility is not in conformity with the law. **Prof. Ajit Singh is not eligible for promotion under CAS from 1.12.2017 but will become eligible for Professor under CAS only after 30.11.2020 i.e. on completion of 3 years as Associate Professor in Stage 4. Thus, the Committee recommends for fixing his eligibility accordingly.**

After deliberating over the issue the Executive Council decided to also look into the recommendations of the previous committee constitute by the Vice-Chancellor on this issue and

decided to have a copy of the report of the committee. It was also decided that the Chairman of the previous committee may give a presentation before the Executive Council in the next meeting:

RESOLVED THAT a copy of the previous committee constituted by the Vice-Chancellor be sent to the members for their perusal and the Chairman of the Committee be requested to make a presentation on the committee's report before the Executive Council in the next meeting.

RESOLVED FURTHER THAT the Registrar shall review the entire file of Prof. Ajit Singh regarding his recruitment as Associate Professor and his promotion as Professor under CAS and submit the facts of the matter before Executive Council.

**ECR 231
ITEM 15**

CONSIDERED the recommendation of the committee constituted for providing cashless medical treatment facility in the ICU/CCU/Indoor wards and the disbursements of prescribed medicines to the employees and pensioners of the University and their dependents family members to minimize the hassles of reimbursement of medicine and hospitalization charges.

RESOLVED THAT the recommendation of the committee, be approved for in principle and a detailed guideline be worked out for its implementations.

ECR 232
ITEM 16

CONSIDERED the Minutes of the 5th General Body Meeting of the Institute of Medical Sciences, B.H.U. held on 12.02.2020 regarding governance related issues and IMS-BHU faculty allowances for attending conferences.

RESOLVED THAT the earlier decision of the Executive Council in this regard be reiterated.

RESOLVED FURTHER THAT the same issue be not brought before the Executive Council again and again.

ECR 233
Ex- Agenda-1

Dr. A.K. Singh raised the issue of the complaints received by the members of the Executive Council which are brought before the Executive Council by the members. He emphasized that such complaints should be substantiated by proof and be first examined by the University administration under due process of rules and then brought before the Executive Council for deliberation and decision on it in those cases which warrant the same. The Executive Council agreed to it.

ECR 234
Ex- Agenda-2

Prof. Bachcha Singh raised the matter of an appeal made by Vinay Kumar Singh for review of the decision of the Executive Council made vide ECR No. 422 dated 30.03.2017 imposing penalty on him.

It was informed to the Executive Council that the appeal has been received and it is being examined vis-à-vis the findings

of the inquiry committee and would be put up before the Executive Council for consideration and decision.

The Executive Council resolved that the matter may first be considered by a sub-committee of the Executive Council consisting of its two members, before bringing it to the Executive Council for decision on his appeal.

ECR 235

Ex- Agenda-3

The matter of advertising the position of medical superintendent, SSH, Banaras Hindu University was raised by one of the members of the Executive Council. The matter was discussed in detail. The house was apprised of the fact that the Executive Council of Banaras Hindu University has resolved the following in its meeting held on 26.09.2017 vide ECR No. 471 item 7:

RESOLVED THAT the recommendations of Selection Committees for appointment of teachers, promotion of teachers under CAS, re-employment of teachers, for school teaching positions and of Group A non-teaching officers except Medical Superintendent SSH be approved as per APPENDIX-7 of the Minutes.

RESOLVED Further that the envelope containing the recommendation of the selection committee for appointment to the post of Medical Superintendent, Sir Sunderlal Hospital, BHU be not opened and the post be re-advertised.

The Executive Council also noted that it was apprised of the aforesaid ECR while considering the same matter before passing resolution on it vide ECR No.34 dated July 14, 2018 Ex-Agenda-Item No.1

It was further noted that the said post had been advertised earlier vide Advertisement No. 02/2017-18 dated 19.06.2017 and Advertisement No. 02/2018-19 dated 02.07.2018.

After detailed deliberations, following was resolved:

- 1. The resolution vide ECR No. 471 item No. 7 be followed in letter and spirit.**
- 2. Advertisement for the positions of Medical Superintendent has been released in compliance to the aforesaid ECR and thus holds good.**

ECR 236

Ex- Agenda-4

Prof. H.C. Nainwal, Member, Executive Council raised the issue that the Maithili Study Centre is not yet started even after its creation long back neither any Coordinator of the centre has been appointed nor any activity is being conducted.

After deliberation over the matter it was felt that a Coordinator and Co-coordinator of the centre be first nominated to form a nucleus to make the centre functional. As there is limited expertise available in the area of study it would be appropriate that Dean, Faculty of Arts be appointed as Coordinator of the Centre and Dr. Vandana Jha, VCW, Rajghat as Deputy Coordinator for a period of three years.

Meeting then came to an end with a vote of thanks to the Chair.



(Neeraj Tripathi)
Secretary



(Rakesh Bhatnagar)
Chairman